

Aan de staatssecretaris van
Infrastructuur en Milieu
Mevrouw S.A.M. Dijkma
Postbus 20901
2500 EX Den Haag

DATUM 22 mei 2017
KENMERK CGM/170522-04
ONDERWERP Advies 'milieurisico's van niet-toegelaten transgene petunia's met oranje bloemen'

Geachte mevrouw Dijkma,

Naar aanleiding van een adviesvraag van de Inspectie Leefomgeving en Transport (ILT) over de milieurisico's en destructie van de niet-toegelaten genetisch gemodificeerde (gg-) oranje petunia's die onlangs onder andere in Nederland zijn aangetroffen, deelt de COGEM u het volgende mee.

Samenvatting:

Onlangs hebben de Finse autoriteiten ontdekt dat verschillende oranje petunia variëteiten genetisch gemodificeerd zijn. Deze variëteiten waren afkomstig uit Nederland en Duitsland. Er is in Europa geen vergunning afgegeven voor de teelt en/of de verkoop van genetisch gemodificeerde (gg-) petunia's.

De betrokken bedrijven hebben actie ondernomen en de illegale petunia variëteiten uit winkels en tuincentra teruggehaald. De ILT heeft de COGEM gevraagd om te adviseren over de milieurisico's en de destructie van de gg-petunia's.

Petunia's (*Petunia hybrida*) worden in Nederland veelvuldig als eenjarig perkgoed in tuinen geplant. Zij kunnen zaad vormen en op plaatsen waar petunia's zijn geplant, worden incidenteel zaailingen aangetroffen. Petunia's zijn gevoelig voor vorst en lijken zich in Nederland niet te kunnen handhaven. Mogelijk kunnen petunia's winters met matige vorst overleven.

De aangetroffen gg-petunia's zijn oranje doordat door de aanwezigheid van een transgen een pigment (pelargonidine) gevormd kan worden, dat normaal gesproken niet door petunia's gemaakt wordt. Het betreffende transgen is nog niet geïdentificeerd, maar hoogstwaarschijnlijk afkomstig van een andere plantensoort. Er is geen reden om te veronderstellen dat een oranje bloemkleur de overleving en verspreiding van plantensoorten beïnvloedt. Verder bevatten de gg-petunia's het *nptII* antibioticum-resistentiegen. De COGEM heeft eerder geconcludeerd dat de aanwezigheid van het *nptII* gen in planten geen risico voor mens en milieu oplevert.

Op basis van de huidige kennis over de ingebrachte eigenschappen en gezien de biologische eigenschappen van petunia's, is de COGEM van oordeel dat de risico's van de gedetecteerde gg-petunia's verwaarloosbaar klein zijn.

Er is op dit moment nog niet bekend welke transgene sequenties de gg-petunia's exact bevatten. Wanneer deze informatie beschikbaar is, zal de COGEM deze informatie beoordelen en opnieuw een advies uitbrengen over de niet-toegelaten gg-petunia's.



De door de COGEM gehanteerde overwegingen en het hieruit voortvloeiende advies treft u hierbij aan als bijlage.

Hoogachtend,

Prof. dr. ing. Sybe Schaap
Voorzitter COGEM

c.c. Dr. C.A. van Beekvelt, Inspectie Leefomgeving en Transport
Drs. H.P. de Wijs, Hoofd Bureau ggo
Mr. J.K.B.H. Kwisthout, Ministerie van Infrastructuur en Milieu

Unauthorised GM garden petunia varieties with orange flowers

COGEM advice CGM/170522-04

Summary

The Finnish authorities recently discovered that several of the orange coloured garden petunia varieties present on the Finnish market are genetically modified (GM). No GM garden petunia varieties have been authorised for cultivation, import, distribution or retail in the European Union. The GM petunia varieties (cuttings and seeds) detected in Finland originated from companies in the Netherlands and Germany. The companies involved have terminated all sales of the GM orange petunia varieties and withdrawn the petunia plants and seeds from garden centers and nurseries.

Upon the alert of the Finnish Food Safety Authority (Evira), the Dutch Human Environment and Transport Inspectorate (Inspectie Leefomgeving en Transport, ILT) launched an investigation and submitted to COGEM a request for advice on the possible impact of the unauthorised release of the GM petunias on the environment. In addition, ILT asked COGEM to advise on suitable methods for destruction of unauthorised GM petunias.

The garden petunia (Petunia hybrida) is one of the most popular bedding plants throughout the world. The garden petunia is a so-called tender perennial, which is grown as an annual in many climate zones. The garden petunia may fertilise other garden petunia varieties or close relatives present in Europa. Garden petunia seedlings are observed at locations where they have been planted, but the majority of these reseeded garden petunias will not survive winter time. Garden petunias have no invasive or weedy characteristics and appear to be unable to establish and form self-sustaining populations in Europe.

There are no reasons to assume that the transgenic traits (altered flower colour and antibiotic resistance) introduced in the GM garden petunias alter the fitness of the garden petunia or its relatives. Even though over a million of GM orange garden petunias have been sold, COGEM is not aware of any reports on petunia populations with orange flowers in Europa. In view of the above, and based on the information currently available, COGEM is of the opinion that GM garden petunias with an altered flower colour pose a negligible risk to humans and the environment.

The present COGEM advice is based on the information which is currently available on the unauthorised GM petunias. At this moment the origin of the GM petunias is not known and detailed information on the inserted elements is not yet available. When more detailed information becomes available, COGEM will update its advice.

1. Introduction

The Finnish authorities recently discovered that several of the orange coloured garden petunia varieties present on the Finnish market are genetically modified (GM) (i.e. Pegasus Orange Morn, Pegasus Orange, Pegasus Table Orange, Potunia Plus Papaya, Go!Tunia Orange, Bonnie Orange, Sanguna Patio Salmon, Sanguna Salmon and African Sunset).¹ No GM garden petunia varieties have been authorised for cultivation, import, distribution or retail in the European Union. The GM petunia varieties (cuttings and seeds) detected in Finland originated from companies in the Netherlands and Germany.¹

Upon the alert of the Finnish Food Safety Authority (Evira), the Dutch Human Environment and Transport Inspectorate (Inspectie Leefomgeving en Transport, ILT) launched an investigation and commissioned RIKILT to analyse petunia varieties with orange flowers. RIKILT analysed the suspected petunia varieties by PCR with primer combinations^{2,3,4} that cover the same genomic regions as targeted by Evira (P-35S, P-nos, NptII), other primer combinations³ (T-CaMV 35S, T-OCS), as well as positive and negative controls. RIKILT confirmed that several orange petunia varieties (Go!Tunia Orange, Sanguna Salmon, Viva Orange, Viva Fire, Viva Orange Vein and African Sunset) are genetically modified.⁵ For two of the analysed orange petunia varieties (Cascadias Indian Summer and Sanguna Patio Salmon) no transgenic elements were detected using the above mentioned primer combinations.

The companies involved have terminated all sales of the GM orange petunia varieties and have set out to withdraw the petunia plants and seeds from garden centers and nurseries.⁵

The ILT submitted to COGEM a request for advice on the possible impact of the unauthorised release of the GM petunias on the environment. In addition, ILT asked COGEM to advise on suitable methods for destruction of unauthorised GM petunias.

The present COGEM advice is based on the information which is currently (May 22nd, 2017) available on the unauthorised GM petunias. When more detailed information becomes available, COGEM will update its advice.

2. The genus *Petunia* and *Petunia hybrida*

The genus *Petunia* is native to South America (Brazil, Argentina and Uruguay) and belongs to the family of the Solanaceae.⁶ *Petunia* species ($2n=14$) have a base chromosome number of $x=7$, unlike most species belonging to the Solanaceae which have a typical $x=12$ base chromosome number.⁷

The taxonomy of the genus *Petunia* has been subject to changes. Phylogenetic reconstruction of the 20 taxa in the genus revealed that it consists of two groups. The first group includes species (a.o. *Petunia integrifolia* and *Petunia inflata*) with purple flowers with a short corolla tube (except for *Petunia occidentalis* which has long corolla tubes). The species in this group are self-incompatible

and most likely exclusively pollinated by bees. The species in the second group (a.o. *Petunia axillaris*) have long corolla tube flowers with different corolla shapes and colors. Most plants in this group are self-compatible (except for some *P. axillaris* lineages) and pollinated by either moths, birds or bees.⁶

2.1. The garden petunia (*Petunia hybrida*)

The garden petunia (*Petunia hybrida* or *Petunia x atkinsiana*) is an ornamental plant and not used as food or feed. It is one of the most popular bedding plants throughout the world. In 2013, the garden petunia made the top 5 of bedding plants (11 million plants) sold by one of the largest international flowers and plants marketplaces of the world, Royal FloraHolland.^{8,9} Commercial varieties are either propagated by seed or vegetatively propagated.¹⁰

The garden petunia presumably originated from interspecific crosses between species of the different groups within *Petunia*, i.e. between *P. axillaris* and species of the *P. integrifolia* clade (*P. integrifolia* ssp. *integrifolia*, *P. inflata* or *Petunia interior*).^{7,11} The first hybrids were produced by European horticulturalists in the early nineteenth century (ca. 1830). Hybrids were probably produced multiple times from different accessions of the two parental clades.^{7,11}

The garden petunia is a so-called tender perennial, which is grown as an annual in many climate zones.¹² The garden petunia grows at daytime temperatures of 15°C to 25°C.¹³ It does not like wet conditions¹⁹ and is sensitive to frost^{14,15}, but may survive mild winters. It has been reported that at -5°C 50% of petunia plants die due to freezing injury. Gradual cold acclimation from 15°C to 3°C can decrease the temperature at which 50% of the petunia plants die to -6°C.^{16,17}

The garden petunia can be planted in gardens after the last spring frost¹⁹ and blooms from spring to fall. The majority of petunia varieties are self-compatible, but self-incompatible petunia varieties exist as well.¹⁸ Cross-pollination occurs via insect pollination.

Many garden petunia varieties easily set seeds. After the petunia flower falls to the ground, the calyx begins to swell and turns brown. After a couple of days, it splits open and the seeds fall out.¹⁹ Seeds from garden petunias can be collected and used to rear petunias the next growing season. Seeds germinate within 7 to 10 days (at 21°C to 29°C). Ten to twelve weeks after sowing, the plants can be planted in the garden.¹⁹ Although it is feasible to rear garden petunias from self-collected seed, it is easier to grow them from transplants.¹⁹

Although garden petunias have been cultivated throughout Europe since the early nineteenth century, feral populations appear to be extremely rare. In some of the European flora the garden petunia is mentioned as a casual or neophyte.^{20,21,22,23} The garden petunia (*P. hybrida*) is mentioned as a rare species on the list of vascular plants of the Netherlands.²⁴ The garden petunia may reseed itself and seedlings are observed at locations where they have been planted.²⁵ In addition, there are a few exceptional reports of garden petunias that seem to have survived the winter in the Netherlands.²⁵

Although there are occasional reports of *P. hybrida* in the Netherlands and other countries in Northwestern Europe,^{21,22,24} it is most likely that these are reseeded garden petunias of which the majority will not survive wintertime. The garden petunia is not able to establish and form self-sustaining populations in Northwestern Europe.

No self-sustaining feral populations have been reported in Southern Europe. Garden petunias have been observed outside gardens,²³ but it is unclear whether the observed plants are seedlings that die out or plants that have established.

2.2. Relatives of the garden petunia

Other *Petunia* species, such as *P. integrifolia* (syn. *Petunia violacea*) and *P. axillaris* (syn. *Petunia nyctaginiflora*), are occasionally planted in gardens.^{26,27,28,29} *P. integrifolia* is mentioned as a neophyte in Germany³⁰ and it has been reported as locally naturalised in Southern Europe.³¹ It is unclear whether these reports refer to recurrent introductions of spontaneous seedlings from *P. integrifolia* garden plants or to the establishment of *P. integrifolia*.

3. Hybridisation

3.1 Hybridisation within the genus *Petunia*

The species within the *Petunia* genus have preserved their intercrossing ability, at least under experimental conditions. *Petunia exserta* (at least when used as a seed parent) and *P. axillaris* subsp. *axillaris* are cross-compatible with all *Petunia* taxa that were investigated except *P. occidentalis*.^{32,33}

Despite the lack of intrinsic barriers to crossing between most of the *Petunia* species, hybrids in nature are rare. Natural interspecific hybrids have only been described between *P. exserta* and *P. axillaris* ssp. *axillaris* and between two subspecies of *P. axillaris*.⁶

P. axillaris and *P. integrifolia* can be crossed artificially and produce fertile hybrids capable of setting abundant capsules filled with viable seeds.³⁴ Although there are at least four native populations in which *P. axillaris* and *P. integrifolia* occur together, no natural hybrids have been detected.³⁴

3.2. Hybridisation with closely related genera

The genus most closely related to *Petunia* is *Calibrachoa*. The species within these two genera have different chromosome numbers: for *Petunia* $2n=14$ and for *Calibrachoa* $2n=18$. The species within *Calibrachoa* used to belong to *Petunia*, but were transferred to a separate genus. Over two hundred populations composed of *Petunia* and *Calibrachoa* species are known, but no intergeneric hybrids were observed in these populations even though the same insect species (*Leioproctus* subgen. *Hexanthes* sp.) acts as a pollinator for both *P. integrifolia* and *Calibrachoa heterophylla*.³⁴ Crossing experiments confirmed that the two genera cannot hybridise. *P. axillaris* and *P. integrifolia* have been crossed with *Calibrachoa parviflora* and *C. heterophylla*, but no capsules were formed.³⁴ *P. axillaris* nor *P. exserta* could be successfully crossed with any species of *Calibrachoa*.^{32,33}

4. Unauthorised GM garden petunias

Although the exact make-up of the GM garden petunias is not known at the time of this advice, it can be assumed that a transgene was inserted in the GM petunias that allowed the production of the pelargonidin pigment. At this moment, it is assumed that the GM petunia varieties contain the *DFR* gene of maize (also known as the *Al* gene).³⁵ Besides the transgene(s) involved in flower pigmentation, the GM petunias contain the antibiotic resistance gene *nptII*.

4.1. Development of petunias with modified flower colours

Pelargonidin is one of the three anthocyanin pigments (pelargonidin, cyanidin and delphinidin) and gives rise to orange-red flowers. It is formed from its precursor dihydrokaempferol (DHK) by the dihydroflavonol-4-reductase (DFR) enzyme. There are slight differences between DFR enzymes from different plants species. The natural DFR enzyme of petunia, for example, does not utilize DHK as a precursor and is therefore unable to synthesize pelargonidin. This is why regular petunias do not produce orange-red flowers.^{36,37}

In 1987, German scientists produced the first genetically modified petunias by inserting the *DFR* gene from maize (*Zea mays*). These GM petunias accumulated DHK (owing to the deficiency of the *F3'H*, *F3'5'H* and *FLS* genes)³⁸ and it appears that besides the presence of the maize *DFR* gene, a DHK-accumulating background is required to synthesize sufficient amounts of pelargonidin. Accumulation of DHK is observed in natural mutants, but may also be achieved by genetic modification.

The flowers of these GM petunias were pale brick-red, and showed a variable pigmentation.³⁹ When different transgenic petunia lines containing the maize *DFR* gene were crossed with elite breeding material this resulted in stable bright-orange petunia cultivars with commercial potential.³⁶

Other research groups in Finland and Japan introduced *DFR* genes from ornamental plants, such as gerbera and rose, into petunia, which resulted in intense and stable brick-red/orange petunias.^{40,41,42,43}

COGEM notes that the investigation in the EU on the unauthorised release of GM petunias focuses on petunia varieties with orange flowers. These petunia varieties have been sold worldwide. It is currently unknown what the origin of the GM petunias is, therefore it cannot be ruled out that the GM petunias were used as breeding material to produce garden petunia varieties with different flower colours.⁴⁴ Noteworthy is that the U.S. Department of Agriculture's Animal and Plant Health Inspection (APHIS) states on its website that the GM petunia varieties involved produce various hues of orange, red and purple coloured flowers.^{45,46} This opens the possibility that more commercial petunia varieties are genetically modified as currently envisaged.

4.2 Field experiments/releases of GM petunias

In Germany, over 30,000 transgenic petunia plants carrying a single copy of the maize *DFR* gene were planted in a field trial carried out by the Max Planck institute.³⁹ In 1996 and 1997, this GM petunia line was authorised in Germany for deliberate release in demonstration gardens with a small number of plants (20).^{47,48,49,50}

In the United States there have been several applications for introduction of GM petunias. Since 1989, 88 applications concerning GM petunias have been filed. At least 23 of them are GM petunias with (possible) altered flower colour, two of which involve GM petunias with a maize *DFR* gene.⁵¹ Field experiments with orange GM petunias have been carried out in the early nineties.³⁶

In China, a GM petunia variety is commercially available. This GM variety developed by Beijing University expresses the *CHS* gene resulting in white pigmentation in flowers.^{52,53}

5. Environmental risk assessment

The garden petunia (*P. hybrida*) is a very popular bedding plant, which has been cultivated since the early nineteenth century. It is a so-called tender perennial, which is grown as an annual in many climate zones. The garden petunia may reseed itself and seedlings are observed at locations where garden petunias have been planted. Garden petunias are sensitive to frost and only rare individuals survive the winter. The garden petunia has no invasive or weedy characteristics. The garden petunia is not able to establish and form self-sustaining populations in Northwestern Europe.

No self-sustaining feral populations have been reported in Southern Europe. Although garden petunias have been observed outside gardens in Southern Europe, it is unclear whether the observed plants are seedlings that die out or plants that have established.

Besides the garden petunia there are also some other *Petunia* species which are planted in gardens. In addition, *P. integrifolia* (an ancestral species of *P. hybrida*) is listed as a neophyte in Germany and it has been reported as locally naturalised in Southern Europe.

There are different traits, such as the size, scent, shape and colour of flowers that affect the attractiveness of flowers to pollinators.⁵⁴ As different pollinator species have a preference for different flower colours,⁵⁴ the orange colour of the petunia flowers may influence their attractiveness to pollinators and consequently the chance that the GM petunia varieties fertilise other garden petunias. In this environmental risk assessment, it is assumed that the GM garden petunias are able to fertilise other garden petunia varieties or close relatives present in Europe independent of their flower colour. Garden petunias and its seedlings are sensitive to frost, but in an exceptional case, a rare GM garden petunia or a GM seedling may survive the winter.

There are many species of plants other than petunia which have orange flowers and produce the pelargonidin pigment present in the GM petunias by nature. There are no indications that flower colour influences the fitness or weediness potential of these plants. Since the beginning of this decade, over a million of GM petunias with orange flowers have been sold in Europe. Despite the

large numbers of plants sold, there are no reports on petunia populations with orange flowers in Europe.

The GM petunias contain the *nptII* gene which confers resistance to aminoglycoside antibiotics, such as kanamycin and neomycin. The *nptII* gene is widely present in naturally occurring microorganisms. The chance of so-called horizontal gene transfer (HGT) between plants and bacteria is difficult to estimate, but the likelihood is extremely low. HGT has not been detected under field conditions.^{55,56} The use of kanamycin and neomycin in clinical practice has been largely reduced, and is now mostly limited to veterinary practice. In 1998 and 2000, COGEM concluded that the presence of *nptII* genes in transgenic plants poses a negligible risk to humans and the environment.^{57,58}

In 2004, EFSA also concluded that use of the *nptII* antibiotic resistance gene as marker gene in GM plants does not pose a risk to the environment or to human and animal health.⁵⁹ EFSA reconfirmed its conclusion on the safe use of *nptII* genes in GM plants in a statement published in 2007.⁶⁰

6. Conclusion

Garden petunias have no invasive or weedy characteristics and appear to be unable to establish and form self-sustaining populations in Europe. There are no reasons to assume that the transgenic traits (altered flower colour and antibiotic resistance) introduced in the GM garden petunias alter the fitness of the garden petunia or its relatives. Even though over a million of GM orange garden petunias have been sold, COGEM is not aware of any reports on petunia populations with orange flowers in Europe. In view of the above, and based on the information currently available, COGEM is of the opinion that GM garden petunias with an altered flower colour pose a negligible risk to humans and the environment.

COGEM points out that GM petunias with orange flowers have been developed by several groups in various countries using different approaches. At this moment the origin of the GM petunias is not known and detailed information on the inserted elements is not yet available.

ILT commissioned further molecular analyses of the GM petunias. As soon as more detailed information on the inserted transgenic elements becomes available, COGEM will update its advice and reconsider whether its conclusion that the GM petunias pose a negligible risk to the environment, remains valid.

7. Destruction of unauthorised GM garden petunias

ILT asked COGEM to provide advice on the destruction of GM garden petunias. Destruction of the GM garden petunias is necessary because they are illegal in Europe. A document providing guidance on the destruction of GM petunias was recently published by APHIS.⁶¹

There are several methods that can be used to destroy plants such as freezing, incineration, drying out, cutting of the plant crown, the application of herbicides etc. In this advice, COGEM assumes

that a large number of plants have to be destroyed in a short time. Genetically modified organisms are usually killed by autoclaving or incinerating. Autoclaving is, however, only feasible for limited amounts of plant material.

There are several other methods such as the application of herbicides or composting, that kill large numbers of plants efficiently. The presence of seeds in plant material is, however, a factor complicating the destruction of plant material. Herbicides do not affect seeds and composting only kills seeds if the temperatures are sufficiently high over a longer period. In the Netherlands, industrial producers of compost have drawn up criteria for certified compost (so-called Keurcompost). One of these criteria is that the temperature in the compost heap has to reach 60°C for a minimum of two periods lasting at least three continuous days.⁶² This is sufficient to kill seeds of weeds.⁶³

In view of this, COGEM advises to destruct the GM garden petunias by incineration or industrial composting following the procedures for certified compost. If the GM petunia plant material does not contain seeds, herbicide treatments can also be used to destroy the plant material.

8. References

1. Finnish Food Safety Authority (Evira). Evira removes genetically modified orange petunias from sale (2017). <https://www.evira.fi/en/plants/current-issues/2017/evira-removes-genetically-modified-orange-petunias-from-sale/> (visited: May 17, 2017)
2. Kuribara H *et al.* (2002). Novel reference molecules for quantitation of genetically modified maize and soybean. *J. AOAC Int.* 85: 1077-1089
3. Debode F *et al.* (2013). Development of 10 new screening PCR assays for GMO detection targeting promoters (pFMV, pNOS, pSSuAra, pTA29, pUbi, pRice actin) and terminators (t35S, tE9, tOCS, tg7). *Eur. Food Res. Technol.* 236: 659-669
4. Scholtens I *et al.* (2013). Practical experiences with an extended screening strategy for genetically modified organisms (GMOs) in real-life samples. *J. Agric. Food Chem.* 61: 9097-9109
5. Plantum. Veredelaars werken samen de onbedoelde GMO in oranje petunia het handelskanaal uit <https://plantum.nl/321519665/Nieuws-detail?newsitemid=1416593408> (visited: May 21, 2017) [in Dutch]
6. Reck-Kortmann M *et al.* (2014). Multilocus phylogeny reconstruction: new insights into the evolutionary history of the genus *Petunia*. *Mol. Phylogenet. Evol.* 81: 19–28
7. Bombarely A *et al.* (2016). Insight into the evolution of the Solanaceae from the parental genomes of *Petunia hybrida*. *Nat. Plants* 2: 16074, doi:10.1038/nplants.2016.74
8. FloraHolland. Kengetallen 2014. <https://www.royalfloraholland.com/media/3949231/Kengetallen-2014-NL.pdf> (visited: May 17, 2017)
9. Royal Flora Holland. Annual Report 2016. http://jaarverslag.royalfloraholland.com/annualreport2016_royalfloraholland.pdf (visited: May 18, 2017)
10. Greenhouse Canada. Growing in the Green: Celebrating ‘Year of the Petunia’ <https://www.greenhousecanada.com/crops/flowers/march-april-2014-4018> (visited: May 17, 2017)

11. Bombarely A *et al.* (2016). Supplementary Note 6 to Bombarely *et al.* (2016): Analysis of the genomic origin of *Petunia hybrida*. In: Nat. Plants 2: 16074, doi:10.1038/nplants.2016.74
12. Floridata Plant Encyclopedia (2015). *Petunia x hybrida*
<http://www.floridata.com/Plants/Solanaceae/Petunia%20x%20hybrida/547> (visited: May 17, 2017)
13. Suntory flowers. 2016 Suntory brands.
<http://www.suntorycollection.com/YESS/pdf/2016SuntoryCatalog.pdf> (visited: May 17, 2017)
14. Infotalia. Planten en Bloemen.
www.infotalia.com/nld/tuin/planten_en_bloemen/bloemen/bloem_detail.asp?id=2242 (visited: May 17, 2017)
15. Suntory flowers. FAQs <https://suntoryflowers.eu/faqs/> (visited: May 17, 2017)
16. Yelenosky G & Guy CL (1989). Freezing tolerance of Citrus, Spinach, and Petunia Leaf tissue. Plant Physiol. 89: 444-451
17. Pennycooke JC *et al.* (2003) Down-regulating α -galactosidase enhances freezing tolerance in transgenic Petunia. Plant Physiol. 133: 901-909
18. COGEM (2016). Herziening van kenmerken van planten ten behoeve van de lijst met inperkingsmaatregelen. COGEM Research report CGM 2016-01 [in Dutch, summary in English]
19. The old farmer's almanac. Petunias. How to plant, grow, and care for petunias.
<http://www.almanac.com/plant/petunias> (visited: May 17, 2017)
20. Floraweb. Trefferliste *Petunia*.
http://www.floraweb.de/pflanzenarten/taxoquery.xsql?taxname=petunia&max-rows=10&skip-rows=0&submit_x=0&submit_y=0 (visited: May 17, 2017) [in German]
21. Floraweb. Webkarte *Petunia x atkinsiana* D. Don ex Loud
<http://www.floraweb.de/webkarten/karte.html?taxnr=27326> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in German]
22. Botanical Society of Britain & Ireland. Vice-County Census Catalogue: *Petunia x hybrida*.
<http://www.botanicalkeys.co.uk/flora/vccc/vcccDisDis.asp?code=2843&name=%20Petunia%20x%20hybrida> (visited: May 17, 2017)
23. Acta Plantarum. IPFI Indice dei nomi delle specie botaniche presenti in Italia. Solanaceae *Petunia hybrida* Vilm. http://www.actaplantarum.org/flora/flora_info.php?id=5773&pid=-1&p=12 (visited: May 8, 2017) [in Italian]
24. Nederlandse Databank Flora en Fauna (NDFD) Verspreidingsatlas. Naamlijst van de Nederlandse vaatplanten. <https://www.verspreidingsatlas.nl/soortenlijst/planten> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]
25. Waarneming.nl. Waarnemingen *Petunia* - *Petunia x hybrida* (*P. axillaris* x *integrifolia*) Vilm.
https://waarneming.nl/soort/view/151003?waardplant=0&poly=1&from=2010-01-01&to=2017-05-17&maand=0&prov=0&rows=20&os=0&hide_hidden=0&hide_hidden=1&show_zero=0 (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]
26. Groei&Bloeit. https://www.groei.nl/files/downloads/040_Petunia_0415.pdf (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]
27. MijnTuin.org. *Petunia*. <https://www.mijntuin.org/articles/petunia> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]
28. Diana's mooie moestuin. *Petunia Axillaris*. <http://www.mooiemoestuin.nl/eenjarigen/petunia-axillaris/> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]
29. Bartjestuinzaden. Verkoop van bloemenzaden uit eigen tuin. *Petunia axillaris*.
<http://www.bartjestuinzaden.com/?product=petunia-axillaris> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in Dutch]

30. Floraweb. Artinformation *Petunia integrifolia* (Hook.) Schinz & Thell., Violette Petunie
<http://www.floraweb.de/pflanzenarten/artenhome.xsql?suchnr=31151&> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in German]
31. Flora Europaeae. Ed. Tutin TG *et al.*, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
32. Watanabe H *et al.* (2001). Cross-compatibility of *Petunia exserta* with other *Petunia* taxa. J. Japan Soc. Hort. Sci. 70: 33-40
33. Watanabe H *et al.* (1996). Cross compatibility of *Petunia* cultivars and *P. axillaris* with native taxa of *Petunia* in relation to their chromosome number. J. Japan. Soc. Hort. Sci. 65: 625-634
34. Ando T *et al.* (2001). Reproductive isolation in a native population of *Petunia sensu* Jussieu (Solanaceae). Annals of Botany 88: 403-413
35. HorticultureWeek. Unauthorised genetically-modified petunias found in the UK
<http://www.hortweek.com/unauthorised-genetically-modified-petunias-found-uk/plant-health/article/1432680> (visited: May 21, 2017)
36. Oud JSN *et al.* (1995). Breeding of transgenic orange *Petunia hybrida* varieties. Euphytica 84: 175-181
37. Tanaka Y & Ohmiya A (2008). Seeing is believing: engineering anthocyanin and carotenoid biosynthetic pathways. Curr. Opin. Biotechnol. 19: 190-197
38. Meyer P *et al.* (1987). A new petunia flower colour generated by transformation of a mutant with a maize gene. Nature 330: 677-678
39. Meyer P *et al.* (1992). Endogenous and environmental factors influence 35S promoter methylation of a maize A1 gene construct in transgenic petunia and its colour phenotype. Mol. Gen. Genet. 231: 345-352
40. Helariutta Y *et al.* (1993). Cloning of cDNA coding for dihydroflavonol-4-reductase (DFR) and characterization of dfr expression in the corollas of *Gerbera hybrida* var. Regina (Compositae). Plant Mol. Biol. 22: 183-193
41. Tanaka *et al.* (1995). Molecular cloning and characterization of *Rosa hybrida* dihydroflavonol 4-reductase gene. Plant Cell Physiol. 36: 1023-1031
42. Elomaa P *et al.* (1995). Transgene inactivation in *Petunia hybrida* is influenced by the properties of the foreign gene. Mol. Gen. Genet. 248: 649-656
43. Tsuda S *et al.* (2004). Flower color modification of *Petunia hybrida* commercial varieties by metabolic engineering. Plant Biotech. 21: 377-386
44. Nursery management. Unauthorized GE petunias: USDA, industry weigh in
<http://www.nurserymag.com/article/usda-genetic-engineered-petunias-growers-retailers/> (visited: May 22, 2017)
45. United States Department of Agriculture. Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service. USDA confirms distribution of unauthorized GE petunia https://www.aphis.usda.gov/aphis/ourfocus/biotechnology/brs-news-and-information/unauthorized_petunia (visited: May 18, 2017)
46. United States Department of Agriculture. Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service. USDA confirms distribution of unauthorized GE petunia
<https://content.govdelivery.com/accounts/USDAAPHIS/bulletins/19aec32> (visited: May 22, 2017)
47. Biosafety Cleaning-House. Convention on Biological Diversity. Country's Decision or any other Communication <http://bch.cbd.int/database/record.shtml?documentid=111644> (visited: May 17, 2017)
48. Biosafety Cleaning-House. Convention on Biological Diversity. Risk Assessment.
<http://bch.cbd.int/database/record.shtml?documentid=111643> (visited: May 17, 2017)

49. Bundesamt für Verbraucherschutz und Lebensmittelsicherheit (BVL). Übersicht der Freisetzen. Details zum Freisetzungsvorhaben. Notification Number B/DE/97/65. <http://apps2.bvl.bund.de/freisetzungsliste/az/6786-01-0065/> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in German]
50. Bundesamt für Verbraucherschutz und Lebensmittelsicherheit (BVL). Übersicht der Freisetzen. Details zum Freisetzungsvorhaben. Notification Number B/DE/96/34. <http://apps2.bvl.bund.de/freisetzungsliste/az/6786-01-0034/> (visited: May 17, 2017) [in German]
51. United States Department of Agriculture. Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service. Permits, Notifications, and Petitions. https://www.aphis.usda.gov/aphis/ourfocus/biotechnology/permits-notifications-petitions/sa_permits/ct_status (visited: May 16, 2017)
52. ISAAA GM Approval Database. <http://www.isaaa.org/gmaprovaldatabase/default.asp>
53. ChinaAg. Genetically modified crops in China. <http://www.chinaag.org/markets/gm-agriculture-in-china/> (visited: May 18, 2017)
54. Yuan Y-W *et al.* (2013). The genetic control of flower-pollinator specificity. *Curr. Opin. Plant. Biol.* 16(4): 422-428
55. Smalla K *et al.* (2000). Horizontal transfer of antibiotic resistance genes from transgenic plants to bacteria: are there new data to fuel the debate? C Fairburn, G Scoles, A McHughen (Eds.), 6th International Symposium on the Biosafety of GMOs, University Extension Press University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon
56. Nielsen KM *et al.* (1998). Horizontal gene transfer from transgenic plants to terrestrial bacteria – a rare event? *FEMS Microbiology Reviews* 22: 79-103
57. COGEM (1998). Standpunt van de COGEM ten aanzien van de toelaatbaarheid van het toepassen van antibioticumresistentiegenen in transgene planten. COGEM advice CGM/980929-06 [in Dutch]
58. COGEM (2000). Het gebruik van antibioticumresistentiegenen als markersysteem tijdens de genetische modificatie van planten. COGEM advice CGM/000918-01 [in Dutch]
59. European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) (2004). Opinion of the Scientific Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms on the use of antibiotic resistance genes as marker genes in genetically modified plants (Question N° EFSA-Q-2003-109). *The EFSA Journal* 48: 1-18
60. European Food Safety Authority (EFSA) (2007). Statement of the Scientific Panel on Genetically Modified Organisms on the safe use of the *nptII* antibiotic resistance marker gene in genetically modified plants
61. Animal and Plant Health Inspection Service (APHIS). APHIS guidance regarding the destruction of genetically engineered petunias. https://www.aphis.usda.gov/biotechnology/downloads/disposition_guidance_petunia.pdf (visited: May 18, 2017)
62. Keurcompost. Beoordelingsrichtlijn keurcompost, versie 6.0. http://keurcompost.nl/wp-content/uploads/images/BRL-Keurcompost-6-0_geldend-vanaf-01012017.pdf (visited: May 18, 2017) [in Dutch]
63. Attero. Veelgestelde vragen over compost. <http://www.attero.nl/compost/over-compost/veelgestelde-vragen/> (visited: May 18, 2017) [in Dutch]